

Exhibit A

All the places in media where the official statements by Dept of Homelessness Indicate They Will Not and/or Do Not Serve People Who Live in RVs Despite Them Being ¼ of the Grant Base

1)

<https://sfmayor.org/article/california-department-parks-authorizes-city-use-vehicle-triage-center-candlestick-park>

Oct 21, 2021

“Vehicular homelessness is a growing issue in our community,” said Shireen McSpadden, Executive Director, San Francisco Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing.

Board of Supervisors President Shamann Walton “The Vehicle Triage Center will provide a space for this population to live in dignity ... I want to thank California Department of Parks and City leadership for stepping up and providing a solution that benefits all.”

2)

<https://sfmayor.org/article/mayor-london-breed-announces-opening-bayview-vehicle-triage-center>

Jan 21, 2022

Mayor Breed “As we continue to move forward with our Homelessness Recovery Plan, we must find solutions for people living in their RVs or their cars”

District 10 Supervisor Shamann Walton. “All of our community members deserve to live in a neighborhood that’s clean and safe and our vehicularly housed folks deserve access to basic services like restrooms, electricity, and pathways to housing. This VTC is the first step towards answering the calls...”

“With the Bayview VTC, we continue to develop innovative approaches to the growing issue of vehicular homelessness in our community,” said Shireen McSpadden, Executive Director, San Francisco Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing. “The purpose of the Bayview VTC is to offer stability to individuals and families and to provide a transition from living in vehicles to housing and services that offer an end to their homelessness.”

3)

https://www.sfexaminer.com/archives/san-francisco-opens-service-center-for-people-living-in-cars-rvs/article_81753812-ed2a-5057-9a5c-3035eeb07161.html

Jan 24, 2022

San Franciscans who live in their vehicles now have a space with access to bathrooms, showers and other services.

4)

<https://sfist.com/2022/01/21/bayview-rv-lot-for-homeless-opens-but-many-resist-moving-in-for-lack-of-electricity-resources/>

21 January 2022

The new “vehicle triage center” opened Wednesday at Candlestick Point, but those who’ve been invited to stay are balking at the idea because propane tanks and generators are prohibited.

Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing (DHHS) is vowing to add more electrical hook-ups, they are unwilling to budge on the propane tank and generator bans, considering the fire risk those devices pose. “There are long-term plans for power, but it’s going to take a little while to be up and running, so **we are working on an intermediate solution**,” DHHS deputy director Emily Cohen told the Chronicle. “There’s limited power capacity available currently.”

5)

<https://londonbreed.medium.com/san-franciscos-next-steps-on-expanding-the-city-s-shelter-program-93183d3fde31>

San Francisco’s Next Steps on Expanding the City’s Shelter Program

By Mayor London Breed Jul 20, 2022

“...we are doing the work to add more vehicle triage centers. **Vehicular homelessness** is a significant driver of our unsheltered population, and these sites can serve as a location where people can move their vehicles off the street and get connected to services or access to services and stable housing.”

We are committed to helping those in need. But we cannot continue to allow people who we have offered shelter or housing, to continue to camp on our streets.

6)

<https://localnewsmatters.org/2023/01/14/exhausting-battle-groups-lawsuit-claims-sf-generating-diesel-pollution-at-triage-center/>

Jan 14, 2023

It was originally anticipated that up to 150 vehicles would use the center, each with a connection to electricity. **It was originally anticipated that up to 150 vehicles would use the center, each with a connection to electricity.** According to the complaint, the city believed the location was “optimal” for the intended use, at least in part because the site had existing infrastructure, including water, sewer and electrical poles for lights.

The complaint alleges that notwithstanding those expectations, there is no permanent electrical service to the site and instead the city provides electricity through a cluster of 16 diesel generators that it installed and put into service **without obtaining a permit under the federal Clean Air Act.**

7)

<https://localnewsmatters.org/2023/02/15/bayview-vehicle-triage-center-woes-expose-challenge-of-alternative-shelter-approaches>

Feb 15, 2023

... according to research by the city's Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing, there were people living in 1,088 vehicles city-wide in 2021, representing a significant portion of the approximately 8,000 people experiencing homelessness.

The closest neighbor was an existing private RV Park — Candlestick RV Park — that had accommodations for 165 RVs and 24 tents.

Emily Cohen, Deputy Director for Communications & Legislative Affairs for HSH, presented the program. She explained that the pilot in Balboa Park had been “quite successful” and HSH was “very excited to be able to take our learnings from that pilot program to a second iteration of the model.”

Cohen emphasized that “You can’t drive up to the site and you can’t knock on the gate and ask to come in but this will be very much an invitation only. ...” She emphasized that “...this is a temporary proposal, this project is intended to be short term. This is not a permanent project. We are working towards a two-year lease with state parks.” Cohen stated that the VTC was conceived not as an ending place but as “a launching pad for people to access either affordable housing or other social services...”

Without power for the RVs, there was **no power in the vehicles** for refrigeration or to charge a phone or a laptop. (The city says there is an external charging station). The only lighting at the VTC came from the large overhead parking lot lights powered by 16 loud and foul-smelling diesel generators that the city brought on site when it turned out that connecting to PG&E's grid was not going to happen quickly.

The availability of power had been part of HSH's pitch: “We want to and will make sure that the site has amenities like blackwater pumping, restrooms, showers, laundry, electricity, meeting space, and 24 seven security and staffing,” Cohen said at the September 2021 presentation.

Cooking is not allowed, even in the RVs that have kitchens. You would need propane, and that isn't permitted. (HSH says the state fire marshal won't allow it, even though propane is used in the trailer park on private land next door.)

aren't allowed to have visitors at the VTC

In order to get the site in operation, the city's Department of Public Works asked the City Planning Department if a CEQA review of the VTC would be required. The department concluded that no environmental review was necessary because of a statutory provision that allowed a “Low Barrier Navigation Center” as a “use by right.”

The city did not do any soil testing, though Cohen says that some form of air quality evaluation is currently being done in connection with the city's pending application for generators to provide prime power. ... city has dug large holes in the ground to pour concrete for the towers where the new solar panels and lights are installed. The excavated soil was piled next to the towers.

According to an internal Feb. 1, 2023, HSH report, of the 47 people who have exited the VTC to date and who gave an exit interview, 79 percent left for a "place not meant for habitation (e.g., a vehicle, an abandoned building, bus/train/subway station/airport or anywhere outside)." Only four people moved to transitional housing; the others went to different temporary placements (halfway houses, friends' houses, shelters). Cohen is not deterred. She says HSH has learned that vehicle dwellers are "a very unique population to serve and somewhat different than the population we serve in our shelter and supportive housing programs. And we find that people are largely less interested in moving out of their vehicles and into housing than I think we would have hoped." Going forward she says, "we have a lot of work to do with the community as we design programs for the specific segment of the homeless community in terms of thinking about what they want to get out of this."

8)

<https://localnewsmatters.org/2023/03/01/environmental-group-fights-to-block-permit-for-diesel-generators->

March 1, 2024

In their comments, CHCA highlighted an internal email in which the district's director of engineering remarked to a colleague that the city was planning to "energize the RV village with deadly diesel PM" (particulate matter) and asking "What is SF doing?"

The city had to scramble to get temporary power for the parking lot lights, and the center opened in January 2022 without electric service that could connect to RVs. More than a year later, there is still no power in vehicles for lighting or refrigeration or charging a phone or a laptop. Vehicle residents have also been prohibited from using propane as a power source. The only lighting at the VTC comes from the large overhead parking lot lights initially powered by 16 small, loud, and foul-smelling diesel generators that the city brought on site. The city's own health code states: "Diesel exhaust is linked to short- and long-term adverse health effects in humans, which include lung cancer, aggravation of respiratory and cardiovascular disease, aggravation of existing asthma, acute respiratory symptoms, and chronic bronchitis and decreased lung function."

According to CHCA's comments, the city's health code restricts the use of back-up diesel generators larger than 37.3 kilowatts by private operators to a maximum of 50 hours per year. The generators the city seeks to install are each three times that size and would be used for prime power, operating 12 hours a day, 7 days a week for up to 13 weeks a year. Helen Kang, counsel for CHCA, notes the irony in the city trying to install generators at the site that its own health code would ban if any private party sought to do so. CHCA's comments fill 31 single-spaced pages with more than 100 footnotes citing legal and environmental authorities. They allege that the VTC is "unlawfully sited" in Candlestick Point State

Recreation Area and accuse the city of rushing to construct the project “without proper planning or environmental review.”

The district’s regulations require that the notice be in writing and that the district or applicant “distribute the notice ... to each address within a radius of 1,000 feet of the source.” The generators are to be placed within the VTC, very close to the vehicles parked there. Because of that proximity, residents of the VTC would arguably have the most immediate interest in air quality on the site. Yet according to some residents living there, **no notice of the comment period has been distributed to them**. They say that no such notice was delivered to their vehicles or posted on the communal bulletin board, although, ironically, on or about the date the notice should have been distributed, the city posted a notice that the VTC would be closing at the end of the year and all residents would need to leave then. The city’s Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing did not know whether written notice had been given to VTC residents and said the Department of Public Works managed the permit application process. DPW could not be reached immediately for comment.

This is not the first time that site residents have been overlooked in the permit process. In the city’s application for the permit, it was asked to state the distance “to the property line of the nearest residence.” The city responded that it was 1,575 feet (roughly a third of a mile). While that appears to be the distance for neighbors living on other properties, it failed to consider people living in the 49 vehicles parked within a few hundred feet of the generators. In other words, **while the permit application provided distance information concerning neighbors and neighboring properties, it did not include similar information for people living in the city-operated “safe parking” center.**

9)

<https://localnewsmatters.org/2023/04/03/bayview-triage-center-sees-new-delay-getting-generators-after-permit-stalls-on-technicality>

Despite public promises that the site would have electric service that would allow RVs to have power, the site has not yet been connected to PG&E’s grid. In the meantime, **the city has only been able to power the overhead lights in the parking lot**. ... At first that lighting was provided by 16 small diesel generators that were loud and foul smelling, according to VTC residents. **The city did not get a permit for the generators**. That attracted a federal lawsuit from a neighborhood group under the Clean Air Act. After the lawsuit, the city replaced the diesel generators with more than a dozen solar-powered pole lights. It also applied for a permit to run two large diesel generators that would provide “prime power” to the entire site, including the RVs, pending a connection to the grid.

The next day, Cohen emailed the director of the California State Park and Recreation Commission and formally requested an extension. She reported that in the operation of the VTC, “we have been able to provide **a safe, clean, and dignified place for people living in their vehicles** to stay while connecting with social services and housing assistance.”

10)

<https://localnewsmatters.org/2023/05/02/nomad-in-a-settled-city-raises-voices-of-a-traveller/>

Electric service for the vehicles in that location was crucial. “Providing clients with an individual power outlet to power personal devices, medical equipment, and heaters is a critical component of HSH’s program and engagement strategy,” a representative of the Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing explained to the Mayor’s Office in a July 18, 2022, memo. She elaborated: “Guests need access to power to keep warm, prepare food, run medical equipment, and charge personal devices.”

The city convinced the planning officials that the site was exempt from CEQA — the state law that requires cities to consider the environmental impact of projects before they get underway — so there was no soil testing to see if the old parking lot was a safe place for human beings to live. Mayon found out the site was directly across a narrow sliver of the Bay from Hunters Point, a former shipyard that had been declared a SuperFund site and not yet been cleaned up. The body of water that separated the VTC from the shipyard was part of the superfund site, and its waters lapped up to the shore within 100 feet of the parking lot. The winter of 2023 brought punishing rains, flooding the entrance to the VTC so badly the city had to bulldoze a new way in.

... surveillance cameras overhead and fencing all around. She could not have visitors. She had to endure as many as three “wellness checks” a day from workers who at times (mostly on weekends) banged aggressively on the walls of her RV until she answered their questions,

11)

<https://nypost.com/2023/10/10/san-francisco-paying-12k-month-for-homeless-rvs-while-tech-workers-sleep-in-pods/>

Oct. 10, 2023

There are so many rules, like I can’t park my truck inside. I’ve had to park my truck on the street. It’s already been broken into three times, so sometimes I sleep in my truck instead

You can’t have visitors, and if you have too much stuff, they take it away from you.

12)

<https://localnewsmatters.org/2024/02/01/living-in-camp-dismal-residents-of-bayview-rv-site-try-to-unionize-to-improve-conditions/>

Feb 1, 2024

launched a petition to form a tenants’ union called the “Candlestick 35,” a reference to the number of vehicles the city says are parked at the site.

Emily Cohen, a spokesperson for HSH, said Monday that she had not seen or heard of the Candlestick 35 petition, but commented that during “new client intake, VTC guests sign a Participant Agreement which

explicitly states that the VTC is a temporary shelter program and that clients are not tenants and do not have tenants' rights."

The issues begin with alleged environmental contamination at the site ("Bleak, Toxic Location") and move to the rat infestation ("rats everywhere ... absolutely inadequate pest control. They are eating our vehicle wires.") and then on to the now two-year delay in providing promised power at the site. The list continues, raising issues with "inedible food served at unsafe temperatures," alleged Americans with Disabilities Act violations, flooding, and alleged unauthorized seizure of residents' property.

"human zoo tours" conducted without notice through which officials, the media, religious groups and community outreach workers are escorted through the site to show off the facility.

"We can't have visitors, thus social isolation by policy. Even prisons have to allow visitors."

... she hoped that the union will have a seat at the table when policies and decisions are being debated for the site. She noted that for the last two years, the city has been convening a monthly working group of neighbors and interested parties to discuss the VTC, but the residents have never been invited to participate. She pointed out that when the city gave notice of an application for a permit that would allow diesel-powered generators at the site, the city sent the notice to the neighbors in the area because of the potential impacts of polluting diesel emissions 1,000 feet from their properties. However, the city did not give notice to the VTC residents, even though they were living within a coin toss of the generators. Mayon said, "We weren't seen as people living here; they didn't even consider we needed a notice." After a news article about the issue, notice was ultimately provided to the residents.

In Section 20.404 of the Administrative Code, the city requires "all City-funded shelter operators to meet minimum standards of care in the shelter system," including that all shelter clients "be treated with dignity and respect and ... provided with a clean, healthy, and safe shelter stay."

The city brought in 16 diesel-powered generators to power the overhead lighting, but the loud and noxious generators did not provide enough power for the RVs, meaning that residents did not have lighting or heat in their vehicles.

The city found what it believed was at least a temporary solution to the power issue. On Dec. 19, 2023, the city entered into an agreement to rent three large mobile batteries to power the residents' RVs and otherwise electrify the site. As the batteries are used up, they will be hot-swapped with recharged batteries trailered in by the vendor. The city anticipates that the batteries will allow power for the residents eight hours a day. Rachel Gordon, a spokesperson for the Department of Public Works — the department that handled the procurement — said the batteries are emission-free. When asked if it was new technology and, if not, why it wasn't used sooner, Gordon said, "The vendors available to us did not have this technology as an option in spring/summer of 2022 when we were researching sources for temporary power." The batteries will be used until a connection to the grid is up and running. Emily Cohen, a spokesperson for HSH, estimated that it will take another five months, though that depends on PG&E, and given the prior delays, Cohen was not willing to go to the bank on that estimate. Gordon gave a different response. She said it would be, "Potentially six to seven months." Unfortunately, according to Cohen, the city will not be allowed to add more capacity at the site until it is connected to the grid, and so for the next five (or six or seven) months or more, only 35 vehicles will be supported at the site, even though it was initially supposed to accommodate 155. If tenants at the Bayview VTC consume the amount of energy estimated in a purchase order for portable batteries at the site, it would amount to a monthly charge of \$1,955 for each of the 35 vehicles.

the city has limited electric usage to eight hours a day.

a person identified as a staff member for Urban Alchemy reports to the residents that according to the exterminators they consulted, getting rid of the rats is “kind of like you jump in the water and say we’re going to get rid of all the fish.”... .. they began to use high-pressure hoses to clear the area of rat feces and debris which, she says, blew clouds of toxic and unhealthy particles all around the lot.

13)

<https://sfstandard.com/opinion/2024/08/17/london-breed-ultimatum/>

London Breed: No more excuses, no more apologies. SF won’t tolerate encampments any longer

Defending her “aggressive” crackdown on encampments, the mayor argues that homeless people have only one choice left: accept help or get out.

By [London Breed](#) Mayor of San Francisco/ Published Aug. 17, 2024

The truth is there is a small subset of people in our city — often living in tents, often suffering from compounding issues of drug addiction and/or mental illness — who are much more difficult to help.

We are making it clear that this is no longer a city where you can stay on the street.

... we must take a firmer hand — and the Supreme Court’s Grants Pass decision has affirmed our ability to do so.

Our goal with enforcement is not to punish people; it’s to make clear that when we offer help — whether by our encampment teams in the moment or by another outreach worker making their daily rounds — that these offers are not an option. They are *the* option.

14)

<https://www.sfchronicle.com/sf/article/breed-homeless-people-living-in-rvs-in-s-f-tow-19779772.php>

Sept 20, 2024

Homeless people living in RVs in S.F. who refuse shelter will face towing

[Mayor London Breed](#) confirmed Friday that San Francisco is planning aggressive restrictions on overnight parking of recreational vehicles to tackle the surge of people living in them amid neighborhood resistance.

[Breed](#) said people living out of RVs parked on San Francisco streets could soon see their vehicles towed if they turn down offers of shelter.

Under a new law proposed by Breed, oversize vehicles parked overnight — between midnight and 6 a.m. — on city streets could be towed if those living in them have previously rejected an offer of shelter, housing or other services. The law would apply only to large vehicles, such as mobile homes, trailers and campers, that are inhabited.

“San Francisco is a compassionate City that will always lead with housing and shelter, and other supportive services, but we must enforce our laws to ensure that our streets are safe, livable, and

accessible to everyone,” Breed said in a statement. “If someone is offered housing, shelter, and support but turns us down, they cannot remain on the streets.”

Breed, who is in the middle of a heated reelection campaign, is particularly focused on cracking down on a portion of the city’s homeless population that officials say are “service-resistant.”

City officials have also taken various measures to crack down on people living in their vehicles, including reviving an old parking ban on Bernal Hill, reconfiguring parking spots on the Lower Great Highway and implementing new parking restrictions near Stonestown shopping center, which forced dozens of families living in RVs in the area to flee.

The mayor’s office said the city’s Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing helped 50 households move from vehicles near the shopping center into long-term housing, but homeless advocates criticized officials for bringing in police officers and SFMTA before all the families and people living in the area had received offers.

San Francisco leaders for years said they would open a safe parking site for RVs on the west side of the city, but they have failed to do so. The city’s only safe parking site, which opened in 2022 at Candlestick Point, serves just 33 vehicles. It was intended to hold up to 155 vehicles, but the city has been hampered by a lack of electricity, accessibility issues and polluting diesel generators.

Jeffrey Tumlin, SFMTA director of transportation, said RVs are causing problems for small businesses and residents, and “we have to do better.”

The city’s current policies prohibit overnight parking of large vehicles only on a small portion of city roads where signs are posted. Vehicles cannot be towed solely for violating those overnight parking restrictions, though officials can tow them for other reasons such as expired registration and blocking access to sidewalks and driveways.

The city recently reconfigured parking spots on the Lower Great Highway to deter RV parking there, but Engardio said the problems persist. “We need to support and create the construction of new housing and shelter for people, but we just can’t let people park on the street indefinitely and create problems for the residents,” he said in an interview.

14)

<https://www.sfchronicle.com/sf/article/s-f-adopts-new-rv-parking-rules-for-homeless-19807849.php>

October 1, 2024

San Franciscans living out of large recreational vehicles could face towing if they don’t accept shelter, the latest move by Mayor London Breed to address homelessness. Beginning Nov. 1, large RVs and trailers parked from midnight to 6 a.m. on city streets where signage is posted could be towed after a 6-1 vote Tuesday by the board of the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency. In instances where someone is living inside the vehicle, city officials must offer shelter to the occupants before towing the vehicle.

“It really is truly a service-first approach,” SFMTA Director of Streets Viktoriya Wise said Tuesday evening during the board meeting. “But what my colleagues found is that until there’s very clear and meaningful enforcement, such as having a vehicle towed, people don’t always want to accept shelter or services.”

“Our message is clear: **accepting our help is not just an option, it is the option.**” Breed said in a news release Wednesday. “If someone is offered housing, shelter, and support but turns us down, they cannot remain on the streets.”

addressing community public health and safety concerns **exacerbated by inhabited vehicles** on city streets.

Under the new policy, SFMTA said officials in the Homelessness Department and Healthy Streets Operation Center would provide the agency or police with license plate and vehicle descriptions of people who refused shelter and that those would be the only inhabited vehicles that could face towing.

did not have a detailed written plan for how the policy would be enforced to ensure that people aren’t inaccurately deemed as refusing shelter.

Living in a vehicle is also prohibited under the city’s police code, but it is not enforced, Wise said.

San Francisco counted 1,444 people living in vehicles in its most recent homelessness census, a 37% increase from 2022

15)

<https://www.sf.gov/news--sfmta-board-directors-approves-new-city-policy-address-oversized-vehicles-parking-across-san>

Oct 2, 2024

New law proposed by Mayor Breed **will allow for an oversized vehicle like an RV to be towed if an offer of shelter or housing is rejected with a goal of getting people to accept services being offered**

will give homeless outreach workers a new tool to get people to accept shelter, housing, and services being offered to those living in oversized vehicles, including recreational vehicles (RVs) on all San Francisco streets. The new law will ensure City streets are used for the purpose for which they were designed—transportation—rather than serving as unofficial parcels for inhabited oversized vehicles.

The approved law will make overnight parking by inhabited RVs a towable offense between midnight and 6 a.m., but only if an offer of shelter, housing, and/or services are rejected.

>>>> PUBLIC DECEIT BELOW <<<<

The Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing (HSH) and City agencies regularly offer RV dwellers services and referrals to **alternative housing**, including offers of shelter, housing, public benefits, and health services. Services are offered on a case-by-case basis based on need, but include:

Paying for the repair and relocation of RVs, including paying for the rent and fees at an RV park of their choice

Access to shelter

Rapid rehousing vouchers, permanent supportive housing, and hotel vouchers

Relocation services, including utilizing the Journey Home program

As an example of this work, since June, HSH has helped 50 households move from vehicles on Winston Road and Zoo Road and into long-term housing, in addition to conducting outreach to RV dwellers across San Francisco. However, despite several efforts to connect some households to services, offers by homeless outreach workers have been continuously turned down. **Given the pending towing, households on Zoo Road were more inclined to accept offers. Today's legislation will apply that same approach citywide.**

"This approval by the SFMTA Board of Directors will help us to enforce our laws to ensure that our streets are safe, livable, and accessible to everyone," said Mayor London Breed. "Our outreach workers are going out every day to offer help to people and to engage with those living in vehicles and encampments. **Our message is clear: accepting our help is not just an option, it is the option.** If someone is offered housing, shelter, and support but turns us down, they cannot remain on the streets."

Residents are frustrated because they pay tickets if their car is a few inches over a line, while an RV in front of their house gets to stay indefinitely and take up multiple parking spaces. The lack of parking turnover denies access to residents and visitors," said Supervisor Joel Engardio, who represents the Sunset neighborhoods on the Westside. "There are times when people need to sleep in their vehicle, and they deserve leeway when the vehicle fits in the space and follows parking rules. Towing should be a last resort when people dump piles of debris in the street **while engaging in antisocial and illegal behavior.** We cannot accept RVs as a long-term solution to our housing crisis.

Supervisor Catherine Stefani. "With this new law, San Francisco will maintain its commitment to providing housing and services to those in need, while mitigating health and safety risks in our neighborhoods. **By equipping City agencies with this necessary tool, we can better protect our communities** and support our most vulnerable residents."

Supervisor Rafael Mandelman. "That is true of encampments on our sidewalks and in our parks, and it is true of RVs on our streets. We can and should offer shelter and services to unhoused households, but **we simply cannot allow people to live in RVs on our streets indefinitely.**"

"Allowing RVs and other oversized vehicles to serve as makeshift housing is creating too many safety concerns and public nuisances," said Supervisor Matt Dorsey. "Mayor Breed's proposal strikes the right balance by ensuring that those living in vehicles are offered shelter or housing options, while **disallowing a practice that needs to end.**

Existing policy makes it illegal to live in a vehicle on City streets.

In some districts, limited available on-street parking is decreased further due to oversize vehicles being stored on streets. The new law will be implemented and enforced by the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA) in collaboration with the San Francisco **Police** Department (SFPD).

"City workers are out on the streets every day offering shelter and housing to people living in recreational vehicles. This legislation will allow for **parking enforcement when all of those offers have been refused,**" said Jeff Tumlin, SFMTA Director of Transportation.

“The Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing is committed to continuing to provide outreach to people struggling with homelessness and living in their vehicles,” said Shireen McSpadden, Executive Director of HSH. “We will use the shelter, housing and financial assistance available to us to move people out of vehicles and into safe and dignified housing options.”

15)

<https://sfist.com/2024/12/06/the-bayview-vehicle-triage-center-will-close-up-for-good-in-march/>

Dec 6, 2024

... nearly three years later, the Chronicle reports that the Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing (DHS) is pulling the plug on the Bayview Vehicle Triage Center, and everyone will have to get their vehicles out of there by some point in March.

This is ironic, because the site just got its PG&E power hook-ups five weeks ago, after not having full power for nearly three years.

On top of that, DHS is decommissioning the site a full nine months before the city's lease on the place is up, after it was underutilized and suffered a series of logistical snafus.

“We’re really not in the business of running RV parks, and that was very clear to us in this process,” DHS executive director Shireen McSpadden told the Chronicle.

When the program expires, the DHS hopes to transition people into permanent housing “or provide them with other support such as vehicle repairs,” according to the Chronicle. But the RV-dwelling crowd tends to resist housing support, because they do not consider themselves homeless, and are fine with their status quo. The city is also considering temporary vouchers for existing RV parks in the area, or safe parking spots at other shelter sites that are yet to open. This is an issue, because people living in vehicles are the fastest-growing segment of the SF homeless population. The latest homeless point-in-time count showed nearly 1,500 people living in vehicles in SF, a 37% increase over the previous count. The sad thing is that the closure of this Bayview Triage Center will put even more vehicle-dwellers out on the streets. The upside, in this case, is that there are so few people using this facility that it will not appreciably increase that population of vehicle-dwellers on the streets.

16)

<https://www.cbsnews.com/sanfrancisco/news/san-francisco-to-close-parking-site-for-homeless-living-in-vehicles/>

The City of San Francisco is set to close its only safe parking site for homeless people living out of their vehicles in early 2025.

A budget analyst report in 2023 estimates the cost per vehicle at the site to be about \$140,000 per year. Despite that, city officials just managed to connect reliable power in October, nearly three years after opening. There are about 30 vehicles at the site.

17)

<https://www.sfchronicle.com/sf/article/homeless-parking-site-close-19962351.php>

Dec 6, 2024

The Bayview Vehicle Triage Center in an underused parking lot in Candlestick Point will permanently shutter in early March — nine months before the city’s lease for the site was set to expire. Case managers will work with residents living in the site’s 30 vehicles over the coming months to transition them into permanent housing or shelter or provide them with other support such as vehicle repairs, according to the Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing.

The closure is surprising considering city officials **finally managed to connect the site to reliable power in October, nearly three years after its opening**. But the site served far fewer people than projected, failed to make a dent in San Francisco’s homelessness crisis and cost significantly more than initial estimates.

City budget analysts in late 2023 reported at that time that “assuming an ongoing capacity of 35 vehicles per night, the cost per vehicle is approximately \$140,000 per year, which is by far the most expensive homeless response intervention.” All told, the city and state spent about \$15.5 million on capital and operating costs on the project.

Shireen McSpadden, executive director of the homelessness department, said her agency made the decision to wind down the site due to its high costs and limited success. **Many of the residents, she said, were not interested in moving into permanent housing, which was a major goal of the program. “We’re really not in the business of running RV parks, and that was very clear to us in this process,”** McSpadden told the Chronicle.

The site’s impending closure highlights the **lack of a clear strategy by San Francisco officials to address one of the fastest-growing segments of its homeless population: people living in vehicles**. Earlier this year, San Francisco counted 1,444 people sleeping in vehicles, trailers and mobile homes, marking a 37% spike from two years prior, according to its biannual survey of homelessness.

The rise in vehicular homelessness — and **a lack of sanctioned places to send people — has created a more pressing challenge for the city’s homelessness department** and prompted complaints from neighbors about street safety and sanitation issues.

a new policy in October in which San Franciscans living out of large **recreational vehicles could face towing if they don’t accept shelter**. But that could come to an end before it’s begun: The Board of Supervisors is scheduled to vote Tuesday on an appeal of the new legislation.

McSpadden said Thursday that her department was going to “regroup” and **try to determine what role safe parking sites would have in the city’s homelessness intervention system moving forward**. In the spring, the city will open a new homeless site with 60 tiny cabins and 20 safe parking spots, but it’s unclear whether officials will look to add any more additional safe parking sites. Some residents at the Candlestick safe parking site were hoping to move into the new community, located at 2177 Jerrold Ave., but a **spokesperson for the homeless department said they plan to “start fresh” and prioritize RVs parked on neighboring streets** around the new development. McSpadden said her department is considering other interventions for vehicle dwellers, including temporary vouchers for private RV parks.

Residents at the site also have complained about failures to accommodate people with disabilities, prompting an investigation by the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development.

18)

<https://www.sfchronicle.com/sf/article/sf-claws-back-rv-parking-restrictions-homeless-19969866.php>

Dec 10, 2024

The San Francisco Board of Supervisors on Tuesday rescinded RV parking restrictions crafted this fall by Mayor London Breed ... The policy, adopted in early October by the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency, would have allowed city officials to tow large RVs and trailers parked overnight on city streets where signage was posted outlawing it. City staff would have been required to offer people shelter before towing an occupied RV.

d only issue citations, and new signage to ban overnight RV parking required SFMTA board approval. SFMTA Director of Streets Viktoriya Wise called it a “tool of last resort” to address a “difficult, difficult issue.”

City transit and homeless response officials portrayed the policy as a balanced approach designed to get people who are living in vehicles into safer and more stable housing while also addressing community concerns

Mandelman, who sided with SFMTA, called the policy “compassionate” and “constrained,” adding that some San Franciscans may argue it didn’t go far enough.

But Preston wasn’t swayed, arguing that the SFMTA’s justification for the policy wasn’t “remotely compelling against the immense harm that it could cause.”

The Department of Homelessness late last week announced that in March they would close San Francisco’s only safe parking site for people living in vehicles at Candlestick Point. That announcement came days after the agency set new limits on how long homeless families can stay in city shelters and restrict who is eligible.

19)

<https://sfstandard.com/2024/12/13/san-francisco-homeless-vehicle-center-closing/>

Dec 13, 2024

City officials said last week they plan to close the Bayview Vehicle Triage Center, a safe-parking site whose three-year tenure has been marred by lawsuits, bitter complaints from residents, and an ongoing federal investigation.

The site, which was supposed to serve 120 RVs at a time, housed just 35. That’s nine months before the city’s lease on the Candlestick Point property is set to expire.

A spokesperson for San Francisco’s Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing did not say why the city is shuttering the property early but noted that it was originally intended as a “temporary two-year solution to address vehicular homelessness.”

"We have met all of the stated contract goals that the city asked of us at the Bayview Vehicle Transit Center," Urban Alchemy official Kirkpatrick Tyler said in an email. "In line with shelter best practices nationwide, we've adopted a **no outside visitor policy** to protect both the residents at the transit center and our staff."

At one point, residents sought to form a tenants union to fight what they called "shameful" quality of life.

... biggest point of friction stems from the fact that the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development is investigating the site

Residents have long clashed with the Urban Alchemy staffers who run the site. An Urban Alchemy employee at the site described residents who've complained about alleged mistreatment and ADA violations as "entitled" and "troublemakers."

"You're supposed to stay here for six months, get your shit together, then move on to the next," said the employee, who is not authorized to speak to the press and didn't want to be named. "They're just leeching off the resources and preventing others from using them. And then they complain that they're being forced to leave. "Basically, you're just squatting in your mobile home on our property," the employee added.

The property is owned by the state of California.

"Our team has gone out of the way to work closely with the residents at the Transit Center to ensure that their spots are secure," Tyler said via email, "even if there are **minor mistakes** because we know how important it is to provide these residents with a more stable situation than being on the streets."

only reason she moved to the site was because the city threatened to impound her RV if she didn't. ...
"We can't comment on any client's specific situation but **all offers of shelter are voluntary," the Homelessness Department** said over email. "One is not coerced or forced to take any offer of services within the Homelessness Response System."

20)

<http://www.sfchronicle.com/sf/article/bay-area-city-open-homeless-parking-site-for-less-20105429.php>

Feb 4, 2025

San Francisco officials late last year announced that they will close the Candlestick Point project in March — nine months before the lease was set to expire. The decision came after three tumultuous years filled with legal disputes, code violations and extensive complaints from those living in and around the site. The site served far fewer people than projected and cost significantly more than initial estimates. City budget analysts in late 2023 reported that the Candlestick parking site was "by far the most expensive homeless response intervention" in San Francisco.

The site, which opened in January 2022, was meant to hold about 150 vehicles. But due to infrastructure problems and larger-than-anticipated vehicles, **the site was limited to 35.**

In an email, Bouck said the Candlestick Point site was "successful in keeping 35 occupied vehicles off Bayview streets," but that it became clear over time that **people living in the site were uninterested in moving out of their vehicles and into permanent housing** — one of the project's main objectives.

San Francisco estimates that there are more than 1,400 people sleeping in vehicles, trailers and mobile homes. The city plans to open a new homeless site with 60 tiny cabins and 20 safe parking spots this spring, but **it's unclear whether officials will look to add any more additional safe parking sites.**

21)

<https://localnewsmatters.org/2025/02/21/homeless-unions-of-both-sides-of-bay-sue-cities-to-prevent-sweeps-program-closures/>

Feb 21, 2025

The Bayview VTC had opened in January of 2022 with fanfare after the city had run a successful pilot program at Balboa Park for the "vehicularly housed." At that time, **nearly a quarter of the city's 4,300 unsheltered homeless were living in vehicles.**

On Dec. 5, 2024, HSH announced that it would be closing the site at the end of this March and all residents had to be out by March 3. Ironically, HSH made its decision just weeks after the years of effort and millions of dollars in expense to hook up permanent power were finally successful. HSH's decision was a surprise given the recent electrification of the site and the fact that at that point, there was nearly a year left on its lease.

22)

<https://www.sfgate.com/news/bayarea/article/residents-of-bayview-safe-parking-site-on-edge-as-20194297.php>

Feb 28, 2025

The city told them that it had made the "hard decision" to close the site even though there was nearly a year left on the lease. The city informed the residents that if they have not accepted an offer of alternative housing or shelter, they must vacate the VTC with their RVs this coming Monday, March 3.

The city said if they fail to do so, on Tuesday their RVs will be towed and impounded.

It was a hard decision to close the site, and the "gut punch" was that the city had just gotten electric to the site, said Emily Cohen, deputy director for communications & legislative affairs for the San Francisco Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing. In a Feb. 3 interview with Bay City News, Cohen discussed the decision to close the VTC and identified several factors in the closure decision.

She said that her department has learned a lot over the past few years, "but the overarching thing is that **we just have a lot more work to do to understand how to best serve the population of people living in their vehicles,** because it's a really different sort of situation."

Most HSH "clients" are "sleeping rough" or in encampments and getting into shelter is their priority, and **"we found a really different sort of psychology and motivation at the vehicle triage center,"** Cohen said.

"There are a portion of people who live in their vehicle **who would like to be left alone to live in their vehicle** in a safe place," she said.

Other factors influencing the closure were the great infrastructure expense, the fact that the state lease could not be renewed again, as well as expensive environmental litigation instituted by the neighbors. She also mentioned the challenges in making a site like the VTC accessible.

She said that the different motivations of vehicle dwellers, when combined with those issues "just added up to enough. **It's time to wind this down, rehouse people and try a different model going forward.**"

She added, "I think that that's what government is supposed to do. If something's not working, you're supposed to end it and move on. Like, we don't want to just keep doing something that has that is demonstrating that it's not working."

Their RVs are their homes and, for many, their most valuable asset. For the most part, the housing or shelter that they have been offered is, in their opinion, either unworkable or illusory and **they would likely have to give up their RVs to accept the offer**

23)

<https://www.nbcbayarea.com/news/local/san-francisco/san-francisco-safe-parking-site-to-close/3805943/>

Feb 28, 2025

The city said everyone on the site was offered permanent housing, rental subsidies, alternative shelter, or relocation assistance before the closure, and most have taken advantage of that assistance.

The city spent millions on capital costs for the **35-spot site**, which was recently equipped with electricity. The San Francisco Chronicle reported that the high costs and limited success are among the reasons for the closure.

The city said that those who have accepted offers can stay onsite for an extension while their housing is finalized. Those who haven't have to be out by Monday.

24)

<https://www.nbcbayarea.com/news/local/san-francisco/san-francisco-safe-rv-parking-lot-cleared/3807854/>

March 3, 2025

Residents at San Francisco's Bayview Vehicle Triage Center -- a city-run safe RV parking site at Candlestick Point -- were being kicked out Monday. This after some residents had been told last week that they would be able to stay on site until they were able to move into more permanent city housing

On Friday, NBC Bay Area was among those who reported that some residents would be allowed to stay at the RV site as long as they had accepted an offer of housing -- and that housing was not available for them to move into yet. On Monday just before noon, a city Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing spokesperson re-confirmed that promise with a lengthy statement that reads in part, "For guests who have accepted housing offers but the housing placement is still pending, they will be able to stay onsite for a short period of time until they move into their housing." The spokesperson's statement even confirmed that 33 people are still at the RV park, 11 of which have agreed to accept the city's offer of housing.

Then, an updated statement from the Homelessness and Supportive Housing spokesperson said, "All guests will be leaving the site today, March 3. All guests will have the option to transfer to a shelter program."

NBC Bay Area reached out to the Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing and the mayor's office for clarity about why the city has changed its position on the RV park so suddenly, and has not heard back.

25)

<https://www.nbcbayarea.com/news/local/san-francisco/residents-rv-parking-site-housing/3808935/>

March 4, 2025

On Gilman Avenue in the Bayview neighborhood Tuesday, several RVs were parked on the street after people were evicted from the city-run safe RV park where they had been staying.

People whose RVs were out on the street said they had been promised they could stay in the park until the permanent housing the city had promised was ready. But that all changed on Monday. "They rounded everybody up, they told everybody everything is getting locked up at five and threw us out," former RV park resident Melissa Carter said. "They said the sheriff's coming."

Carter said she and her husband are looking forward to moving into city housing, but their place won't be ready for another three weeks. Until then, they're out on the street.

26)

<https://www.sfchronicle.com/sf/article/s-f-spent-millions-on-a-homeless-rv-dweller-site-20200841.php>

March 4, 2025

The demise of San Francisco's only parking site for homeless people living in vehicles could be used as a case study on how difficult it is for one of the nation's wealthiest cities to solve its intractable homelessness crisis. Over the past three years, San Francisco has poured more than \$18 million into establishing and operating the site in an underused parking lot at Candlestick Point — probably the most expensive per capita intervention ever tried by the city. But despite city efforts to get the residents into housing or shelter, when officials shut down the site late Monday night, nearly all of the site's 35 or so residents were back to where they started — on the streets. Many didn't go far, either. On Tuesday morning more than a dozen RVs, trailers and other vehicles were stopped on either side of Gilman Avenue, a quarter-mile from the shuttered site.

The site, which opened in January 2022, was meant to give hundreds of vehicle dwellers a temporary place to stabilize, get connected with jobs and health care, and transition into permanent housing. But the city grossly missed the mark.

Shireen McSpadden, executive director of the city's Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing, announced the closure of the site in late December, citing its exorbitant costs and limited success stories. Originally designed to hold up to 150 vehicles, the site never held more than 35 because of infrastructure issues and planning problems. A lack of electricity at the site led to the use of polluting diesel generators, which sparked a lawsuit from neighboring residents and necessitated expensive daily meal deliveries. Several residents filed complaints about a failure by the city and nonprofit operators to accommodate people with disabilities, which prompted probes by the U.S. Department of Housing and

Urban Development. Less than a fifth of the 132 households served over the three years had a “positive exit,” which officials define as leaving for some form of housing or shelter.

Homelessness department spokesperson Deborah Bouck said in a statement Monday that everyone was offered permanent housing, rental subsidies, alternative shelter or relocation assistance before the site’s closure. The agency and nonprofits running the site, she said, had “held community meetings with guests, gave ample written notification and worked diligently with guests to identify places for them to go upon closure of the site.” However, only two people moved into permanent supportive housing before the site shuttered.

About a dozen others planned to accept offers for housing, but they were informed days before the shutdown that their units would not be ready in time. The city set those people up with a congregate shelter bed in the interim, but most said they would rather wait it out in their vehicles.

In a statement provided to the Chronicle on Feb. 27, Emily Cohen, a spokesperson for the homelessness department, said that people with pending housing placements would be “able to stay onsite for a short period of time until they move into their housing.” But by Monday, the agency seemed to pull an about-face. Nonprofit staff operating the site told everyone they had to leave by 5pm

As the Monday evening deadline neared, an employee from the homelessness department and Urban Alchemy rode around on a cart, giving people a countdown. Residents were frantically calling tow trucks, packing up belongings and figuring out their next move.

San Francisco earlier this year counted more than 1,440 people sleeping in vehicles, trailers and mobile homes across the city, marking a 37% spike from two years earlier, according to its biannual survey of homelessness. After complaints from residents regarding this growing segment of the city’s homelessness population, former Mayor London Breed proposed new overnight RV parking restrictions in the run-up to the November election.

San Francisco spent \$7.1 million on capital costs for the parking site at Candlestick Point and more than \$3.5 million on operations each year, according to the homelessness department. Despite serving about a fifth of the site’s initial anticipated capacity, officials did not substantially modify the cost of the contract with the site’s two main operators, Urban Alchemy and Bayview Hunters Point Foundation.

Supervisor Shamann Walton, who represents Bayview-Hunters Point, said he supported the site’s closure with the understanding that officials were working to move its residents into stable housing and open a new interim homeless housing project at 2177 Jerrold Ave. with 60 tiny cabins and 20 parking spaces for people living in vehicles.

But on Monday, hours before the scheduled closure of the Candlestick Point site, Walton met with staff from the homeless department and mayor’s office who informed him that they were considering eliminating the safe parking space at the Jerrold Avenue site and instead put more than 200 shelter beds there. Walton called the move a “bait and switch” and said he wasn’t going to entertain the idea.

27)

<https://abc7news.com/post/san-francisco-rv-owners-plead-help-city-tows-vehicles-safe-parking-site-candlestick-point/15975283/>

March 3, 2025

All the while, outrage from the 30 plus people who were still living there and now don't know where they will go. Those with the City of San Francisco issued a statement, in part saying, "Everyone onsite was offered permanent housing, rental subsidies, alternative shelter, and/or relocation assistance prior to the closure of the site."

The San Francisco Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing issued this statement: "Since opening in January 2022, the Bayview Vehicle Triage Center has served 132 households living in their vehicles. As part of our support for guests at the VTC, the onsite provider offers case management, housing assistance, benefits advocacy, employment assistance, medical referrals and vehicle repair. Over the past several months HSH and the nonprofits operating the site have held community meetings with guests, gave ample written notification and worked diligently with guests to identify places for them to go upon closure of the site. Everyone onsite was offered permanent housing, rental subsidies, alternative shelter, and/or relocation assistance prior to the closure of the site. There are some guests who are working towards housing, and they will maintain their prioritization for housing even after the project is closed. All guests who were present on site on March 3rd were offered shelter as a last final placement offer before closing the program."

28)

It's Curtains for the Bayview RV Triage Center, Closing Today After Blowing Through \$15 Million

March 3, 2025

Per NBC Bay Area, everyone staying at the site has been offered housing, alternative shelter, relocation assistance, or some form of rental subsidies. A few stragglers will be allowed to stay a bit longer if their housing deals are still being finalized. But obviously, many of these people may not have the means to get their vehicles out of there, so there may be quite a mess left behind.

29)

<https://www.kalw.org/bay-area-news/2025-03-05/san-francisco-closes-vehicle-triage-center-for-people-without-homes>

March 5, 2025

When the site officially closed on Monday, the city notified residents that they needed to exit the center, or their vehicles – some of which are inoperable – would be towed.

30)

<https://www.sfstandard.com/2025/03/19/san-francisco-homeless-311-response-times/>

March 19, 2025

Several

People living in the RVs said the city's homeless outreach team had promised them spaces at another parking site, Jerrold Commons. But when city workers moved the group on March 12, no social workers were on the scene - just police and tow trucks. The Dept of Emergency Management said that none of the RV occupants on Gilman accepted shelter, but the City's outreach team would "continue to work with the former guests to support their transition." Of the 42 people living at the triage site when it closed, the City moved 12 into housing and 5 into shelter.

31)

ABC documentary @ <https://youtu.be/8Mv2ZDZMtG4?si=JeuOniEBJzpMVg75>

out March 31, 2025 and contains statements by several City spokespersons about how the RVs are dealt with and what plans and concerns they have.

@ minute 16.17 (Statement by Sam Dodge, head of street encampment resolution at Dept of Emergency Management): “Every three months, the Healthy Streets Operation Center do a Citywide canvass, and we find 500 to 600 tents recently, but **a thousand vehicles that seem to be occupied.**”

@ minute 20.40 (Statement by #2 Director at Dept. of Homelessness to SFMTA Board on 10.01.24): “**We at HSH are just beginning that process, um, look at sites that may be accessible for folks with RVs**”. The journalist goes on to say: “The first parking site opened January 2022. This is the Bayview Vehicle Triage Center. It can hold up to 150 vehicles. But a lack of electricity limited that number to just 35. Still the City sees this as a potential solution even though they're planning to close it.

@ minute 21.04 (Statement from HSH Emily Cohen): “**The City really is thinking about opening more safe parking places, so, uh, clean, safe, service-enriched facilities where people living in their vehicles could park, receive services that work towards permanent housing.**” The Journalist asks, “Is the City actively looking for sites?”. Emily Cohen, “Yes”. Journalist asks, “How many?”. Emily Cohen, “We have funding for one additional site and right now, and we're looking for a place.” Journalist asks, “How many people could park there?”. Emily Cohen, “It'll depend on the size of the property we find.”

@ 21.28 the Journalist says, “If the City takes RVs from families, the alternative is grim. Living on the street.”

32)

<https://davisvanguard.org/2025/04/san-francisco-opens-first-shelter-designed-for-older-adults-experiencing-homelessness/>

San Francisco Opens First Shelter Designed for Older Adults Experiencing Homelessness: Jerrold Commons Phase One Delivers 68 New Beds in Bayview as Part of Mayor Lurie’s “Breaking the Cycle” Plan

By Vanguard Administrator April 3, 2025

SAN FRANCISCO — Mayor Daniel Lurie today announced the opening of Jerrold Commons Phase One, a newly built interim housing facility in the Bayview that marks San Francisco’s first shelter designed specifically for older adults experiencing homelessness. The site features 60 individual cabins with a total of 68 beds, including space reserved for individuals currently living in RVs near the site.

The new facility is part of Lurie’s ambitious Breaking the Cycle plan, which seeks to add 1,500 new interim shelter beds across the city and expand services to address homelessness and behavioral health challenges. Jerrold Commons represents a targeted investment in a population that makes up a growing share of San Francisco’s unhoused residents. “Every bed we add is a chance for someone to move off the street and begin to rebuild,” said Mayor Lurie. “Jerrold Commons gives dozens of older adults that opportunity, and it reflects our broader commitment to building a shelter system that actually meets people where they are—physically, medically, and emotionally.”

Designed for dignity and stability, the site includes round-the-clock staffing from WeHOPE, onsite case management, behavioral health support, and caregiving services tailored to older adults' needs. Residents will have access to restrooms, showers, laundry, storage, communal spaces, pet relief areas, and free Wi-Fi, along with two meals per day.

"Jerrold Commons stands as a testament to our commitment to treat people with compassion and provide them with real pathways out of homelessness," said Shireen McSpadden, Executive Director of HSH. "This project not only adds capacity, but centers the specific needs of older adults, helping us work toward our mission of making homelessness rare, brief, and one-time."

The site is also intended to relieve nearby encampments, particularly for people living in RVs near the Jerrold Avenue corridor. **Eight cabins are designated for residents currently living in vehicles.**